cannot finish the whole presentation on what is happening there. ...*(Interruptions)*... It will be discussed.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Let him highlight the problem. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, please give him time to highlight the problem. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It will be taken up.

MOTION OF THANKS ON PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS - *Contd.*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Karan Singh had moved the Motion on 3rd March, 2005 and Shri Vayalar Ravi had seconded the Motion. But the Members could not move their amendments. The Members may now move their amendments.

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI (Kerala) : Sir, if Mr. Vayalar Ravi could not speak on that day, the amendments were also lost in that process.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Vayalar Ravi, there was an understanding.

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: I agree. But the amendments would also lose in that process.

PROF. P.J. KURIAN (Kerala) : Shri Vayalar Ravi did not speak on that day. He had only seconded it. So, he has a right to speak.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Whatever it be, we have discussed it in detail. Please do not raise it again. We have already discussed it. We have to complete it. There are 222 Amendments to the Motion.

श्री राज मोहिन्दर सिंह मजीठा (पंजाब) : उपसभापति जी, मैं निम्नलिखित संशोधनों को मूव करता हूं:-

1. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में 76 मिलियन नए रोजगार सृजन की क्षमता सहित उन क्षेत्रों के नामों का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है जहां ये रोजगार उपलब्ध कराए जाएंगें।"

2. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में जल संचयन हेतु प्रत्येक गांव में पोखर या कुंड निर्माण हेतु समयबद्ध योजना का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

3. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों में सड़कों के रखरखाव व उनको जिला मुख्यालयों एवं राष्ट्रीय राजमार्गों से जोड़ने के लिए समयबद्ध योजना का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

4. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में न्यायालयों में लंबित मामलों को निपटाने के लिए कोई सीमा निर्धारित करने का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

5. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में निर्धारित समय सीमा के भीतर गांवों से पलायन रोकने के लिए प्रभावी कदम उठाने के संबंध में उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

6. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में गंदी बस्तियों के सुधार के लिए राष्ट्रीय स्तर पर लक्ष्य निर्धारित समयबद्ध योजना का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

7. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में अकुशल श्रमिक क्षेत्र में व्यय से कम 92 फीसदी नए रोजगारों के सृजन हेतु प्रभावी कदम उठाने के संबंध में उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

8. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में अकुशल श्रमिकों को प्रशिक्षित करने के लिए किसी योजना का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

9. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में छोटे और सीमान्त किसानों की उपज को लाभकारी बनाने के लिए प्रभावी उपायों का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

10. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में कृषि उपजदर को अन्तर्राष्ट्रीय स्तर पर लाने के लिए लक्ष्य निर्धारित समयबद्ध योजना का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

11. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में कृषि उत्पादन लागत कम करने हेतु मूल्यों में कटौती करने का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

12. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में बाढ़ के जल से विनाश को रोकने तथा उस जल के समुचित उपयोग की योजना का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

13. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में चिन्हित सूखाग्रस्त क्षेत्रों में जल संचय के लिए विशेष योजना का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

14. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में ग्रामीण विकास योजनाओं के क्रियान्वयन में ग्रामीणों की भागीदारी सुनिश्चित करने के लिए किसी समय सीमा का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

15. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में राजनीति में अपराधीकरण को रोकने के लिए चुनाव प्रक्रिया में व्यापक सुधारों के लिए ठोस उपाय करने का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

16. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में व्यापक प्रशासनिक सुधारों का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

17. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में न्याय व्यवस्था में कानूनी प्रक्रिया को सरल और सहज बनाने का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

18. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में कुशल प्रशासन बनाने के लिये प्रशासन को जवाबदेह बनाने का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

19. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में मंहगी चिकित्सा व्यवस्था को आम आदमी, विशेषकर निर्धन तथा निम्न मध्यवर्गीय लोगों की पहुंच में लाने के लिए मौजूदा व्यवस्था में परिवर्तन करने का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

20. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में वाहन संचालन लागत में कटौती करने का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

21. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में बिजली की उपभोक्ता दरों में कमी करने का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

22. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश में योजना व्यय की तुलना में गैर-योजना व्यय को कम करने का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

23. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में उच्च शिक्षा के व्यावसायीकरण पर रोक लगाने का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

24. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में प्रत्येक गांव में या गांव के अधिकतम 1 कि.मी. के दायरे में प्राथमिक विद्यालय स्थापित किये जाने के लिए एक समयबद्ध योजना का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

25. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में पढ़ाई अधूरी छोड़ने वाले विद्यार्थियों की संख्या पर रोक लगाने के लिए शिक्षा व्यवस्था में व्यापक सुधारों का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

26. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश में व्यावसायिक शिक्षा व्यवस्था के विस्तार के लिए लक्ष्य निर्धारित समयबद्ध योजना का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

27. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में कृषि उपज में वृद्धि करने हेतु अनुसंधान और विकास क्षेत्र में व्यापक सुधार लाने के लिए समयबद्ध योजना का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

28. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश की बंजर भूमि को कृषि योग्य बनाने हेतु समयबद्ध योजना का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

29. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में खाद्य प्रसंस्करण उद्योग को लघु उद्योग के रूप में विकसित करने का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

30. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में ईंधन की गुणवत्ता बढ़ाने के लिए देश के कोयला उत्पादन में 60 प्रतिशत तक पाई जाने वाली राख को कम करने के लिए विशेष कदम उठाने का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

DR. ALLADI P. RAJKUMAR (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, I beg to move the following amendments -

31. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the spate of murder of political opponents on a large scale in various parts of the country, particularly in Andhra Pradesh and the Government's resolve to direct the State Governments to stop the political murders with a heavy hand."

32. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the consistent drought conditions prevailing in Andhra Pradesh for the last few years which have adversely affected the farming community and rural economy of the State and the Government's determination to implement a package for the State to enable the people to overcome the effects of droughts."

33. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the large scale suicide being committed by debt ridden farmers of Andhra Pradesh and the Government's resolve to address the problems of farmers of the State and to rehabilitate the affected families of deceased farmers."

34. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the acute shortage of drinking water throughout the State of Andhra Pradesh including its capital Hyderabad and the Government's resolve to the problem on priority basis."

35. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the depleting level of ground water in various parts of Andhra Pradesh which has further been aggravated due to consistent drought conditions in the State and the Government's resolve to overcome this problem within a time - frame."

36. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government's resolve to nationalise all the inter-State rivers so as to ensure equitable distribution of water of such inter-State rivers amongst all the States through which these rivers flow."

37. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the ever increasing cases of kidnappings in the country where criminals and their gangs have made it a thriving business which has shaken the confidence of law abiding people of the country and the Government's determination to eliminate this menace with a heavy hand."

38. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the menacingly increasing incidents of atrocities on women and minor girls more so on the women belonging to *dalit* and other weaker sections of the society in Andhra Pradesh and other parts of the country and the Government's resolve to stop them effectively by amending the Indian Penal Code with more deterrent and stringent penal provisions."

39. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the arbitrary removal of Governors of some States on frivolous grounds."

40 That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the existence of tainted Ministers in the Union Council of Ministers and Council of Ministers in various States."

41. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the entry of dreaded criminals and dons in the polity of nation thereby polluting the democratic process of the nation and the Government's determination to stop the entry of goons into the polity by plugging the loopholes in the law and the system."

42. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the unrest and anger amongst the farmers of the country due to faulty procurement policy of the Government which has led to the exploitation of the farmers in the country."

43. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the plight of chilli growers of Andhra Pradesh who produce more than fifty per cent of total chilli production of the country and who do not get remunerative prices of their produce and the Government's resolve to include chilli in Minimum Support Price regime to protect the interest of chilli growers of the State."

44. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the plight of tobacco growers of Andhra Pradesh and the Government's resolve to solve their problems on priority basis."

45. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the plight of cotton growers of Andhra Pradesh and the Government's resolve to solve their problems on priority basis."

46. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the severe shortage of storage due to non-existance of godowns and cold storages in Andhra Pradesh and other Southern States and the Government's resolve to construct enough storage through chain of godowns and cold storages in Andhra Pradesh and other Southern States."

47. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the difficulties being faced by mango growers of Andhra Pradesh which have hampered export of mangoes from the State resulting in loss of foreign exchange and the Government's resolve to solve the problems of mango growers of Andhra Pradesh on priority basis."

48. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the Government's determination to make market intervention compulsory whenever there is bumper crop of cereals, fruits, vegetables, species, tobacco, chilly, etc. without waiting for the formal request from the affected States."

49. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the Government's resolve to promote tourism in a big way in Andhra Pradesh."

50. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government's determination to fill up more than four lakh vacant posts in various Ministries, Departments and Public Sector Undertakings of the Government so as to contain growing unemployment and unrest amongst the youth of the nation."

51. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the anger and frustration amongst the youth of the nation due to severe unemployment in the county which is being exploited by anti-social and anti-national elements to lure the unemployed youth in

- to their net for dubious activities and the Government's resolve to eradicate unemployment amongst the youth on priority basis."

52. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the Government's resolve to make right to employment a fundamental right by amending the Constitution of India."

53. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not declare that the Government will pay unemployment allowance to the unemployed youth of the country."

54. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the plight of fishermen of the country who brave the cyclones and other storms and even Tsunami and other odds of their profession and the Government's determination to solve their problems on priority basis."

55. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the plight of handloom weavers of Andhra Pradesh and other parts of the country and the Government's resolve to solve their problems on warfooting."

56. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the Government's resolve for rapid industrialization of Telengana region of Andhra Pradesh to remove its backwardness."

57. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the Government's resolve to set up more agro based industries in Andhra Pradesh for its economic development and also for creating more employment opportunities in the State."

58. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the Government's resolve to address the problems of SSI sector in the country within a time - frame."

59. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the lack of basic facilities and drugs including life saving drugs in Government hospitals and healthcare centres of the country and the Government's resolve to address the serious issue on priority basis."

60. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the dangerous implications of large scale manufacturing, sale and distribution of spurious drugs in the country and the Government's resolve to provide capital punishment to the manufacturers, distributors and sellers of such spurious drugs."

61. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the recurrence of Japanese encephilitis in Andhra Pradesh every year taking a toll of human lives, mostly children and the Government's resolve to eradicate this dreaded disease on priority basis."

62. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the ever increasing incidents of vector borne diseases particularly malaria in Andhra Pradesh and the Government's resolve to solve the problem on warfooting."

63. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government's resolve to contain the ever increasing cases of dreaded AIDS in the country through vigorous awareness campaigns and treatments facilities in Governments hospitals."

64. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the fact that the healthcare has become too costly in the country making it out of the reach of the poor and the Government's resolve to provide cheap and affordable medication to the poor on priority basis."

65. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government's determination to establish a permanent bench of the Supreme Court of India at Hyderabad in Andhra Pradesh."

66. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the poor state of affairs of Khadi and Village Industries sector in the country and the Government's resolve to revive this sector on priority."

67. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the Government's resolve to give a minimum compensation of rupees three lakh to every victim of naxalite and other form of terrorism."

68. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the non-payment of *ex-gratia* of rupees fifty thousand promised by the Prime Minister to the families of those farmers of Andhra Pradesh who committed suicides in addition to Rs.1.50 lakh being provided by the State Government of Andhra Pradesh."

69. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the plight of street children who subsist on rag picking, begging, stealing, etc. and the Government's resolve to introduce welfare measures for such children.

70. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the Government's determination to eliminate child labour from the country."

71. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government's failure to control rising prices of all essential commodities, particularly of sugar, edible oils and pulses in the country which have adversely affected the common man."

72. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the failure of the Public Distribution System in the country."

73. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about growing lawlessness in the country."

74. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about growing poverty in the country."

75. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the plight of senior citizens, widows and destitutes and the Government's resolve to solve their problems on priority basis".

76. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention anything about the constantly falling sex ratio in the country which has assumed alarming proportion."

77. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the persistent illiteracy amongst in the female population and more so rural and tribal areas and the Government's resolve to make them literate within a time - frame."

78. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the criminal neglect of ancient historical monuments in the country."

79. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the nudity and vulgarity being shown in the television channels."

80. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the incomplete irrigation projects of Andhra Pradesh and the Government's determination to complete them within a time - frame and the permission to be accorded to the projects by the Central Government."

81. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not refer to the Government's resolve to make roof - top rain water harvesting compulsory in the country.

82. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the severe power shortage in the country and the need for developing the national power grid at the earliest."

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA (Bihar) : Sir, I beg to move the following amendments-

83. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the source of subsistence of the poor families in some of the most backward districts of the country for the remaining 265 days who are proposed to be provided 100 days' employment in a year to-one-member-from-each-family basis under the proposed National Employment Guarantee Bill."

84. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the presence of millions of foreigners mainly Bangladeshi nationals who are illegally intruding into the country and settling here, and lack of resolve of the Government to identify and deport them."

85. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the danger inherent in the public announcement by the Government to confer Indian citizenship on all those who left the country before 1950."

86. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the growing emphasis of several political parties on dividing the society on the basis of religion, caste and creed and fuelling of communal passion as witnessed during the process of the recent elections for constituting Legislative Assemblies in Bihar and Jharkhand, in particular."

87. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the criminalisation of politics and induction of tainted persons in the Union Cabinet."

88. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any concrete road map for economic rehabilitation of the survivors of the Tsunami disaster whose source of livelihood was periled by the tidal waves on 26th December, 2004."

89. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government's resolve to impose strict ban on religious conversions in the country."

90. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the growing incidents of kidnappings for ransom and senseless killings of kidnapped persons in various parts of the country, particularly in the States of Bihar and Uttar Pradesh where it has earned the notoriety of becoming a lucrative industry, and the Government's resolve to tackle this menace effectively."

91. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any declaration that the Government will soon fill up more than four lakh vacant posts in various Ministries/Departments by fresh recruitments and contain the frustration, unrest, anger and depression afflicting a large number of educated unemployed youth across the country."

92. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the lack of basic medical treatment for the poor patients and shortage of drugs in Government Hospitals, dispensaries, Helath Centres, etc. in the country and, particularly in the State of Jharkhand."

93. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need of implementation of the project for setting up super specialty hospitals of the status of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences of Delhi in other parts of the country."

94. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the rising number of TB and Cancer patients in Jharkhand, particularly amongst the tribals, and the Government's resolve to provide medical treatment to the patients through the State Government."

95. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the protection of the peoples' right to health which is being sought to be jeopardised under the new patent regime and the Government's resolve to ensure access to drugs and medicines for all sections of the society."

96. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the menace of AIDS in the country and the failure of National Malaria Eradication Programme in Jharkhand and rest of the country resulting in steep increase in cases of Malaria, Dengue, Japanese

Encephalitis taking toll of human lives and the Government's resolve to eradicate contiguous diseases effectively."

97. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the difficulties faced by the small-scale industries resulting in a closure of large number of units across the country depriving millions of families of their livelihood and the Government's resolve to ensure their revival."

98. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the plight of handloom weavers in the country and the Government's resolve to address their problems."

99. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the poor state of affairs of Khadi and Village Industries in the country despite their potential to generate mass employment especially in the rural areas."

100. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the backwardness of the newly created states namely, Jharkhand, Chhattisgarh and Uttaranchal, despite abundance of natural resources therein and to announce special package for rapid economic development of these States."

101. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government's commitment to make right to housing a fundamental right for the citizens."

102. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the criminal justice delivery system in the country having reached the brink of collapse due to huge accumulation of pending cases in various courts, inordinate delay in disposal of cases and low rate of conviction."

103. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the growing vulnerability of our judicial system to manipulation as manifested by the unsavoury incident of arrest warrant issued by a Magistrate of Gujarat against President of India, Chief Justice of India and others on the basis of a false complaint."

104. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government's resolve towards the empowerment of rural women and facilitating reservation for women in Parliament and Legislative Assemblies."

105. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government's resolve to recover overdue debts of the big industrial houses to Banks."

106. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government's resolve to recover huge income tax dues accumulated against large corporate houses."

107. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government's commitment to resolve the Ayodhya issue in Uttar Pradesh."

108. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government's intention to bring forward a Uniform Civil Code as per article 44 of the Constitution of India in the light of the observations of the Supreme Court of India over the issue in the recent past."

109. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government's determination of imposing a complete ban on the cow slaughter throughout the country."

110. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the plight of the common man due to steep increase in the price of sugar, edible oil, pulses and other essential commodities in the recent past."

111. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government's will to give compensation of not less than Rupees Five Lakhs to the next of kin of those killed by terrorists outfits like naxalities, ULFA, JeM, etc."

112. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government's resolve to implement the Ward given on 9th July, 1999 by the Board of Arbitration in CA Reference No. 5 of 1993 granting the Cash Handling Allowance to Post Office employees who have been handling cash, making it an integral part of the celebration of the 150th anniversary of Indian Postal Services by the country this year."

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos.113 to 156) to be moved by Shri B.J. Panda. He is not present. Amendments (Nos.157 to 169) Shri Pyarelal Khandelwal.

श्री प्यारे लाल खंडेलवाल (मध्य प्रदेश): उपसभापति महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित संशोधनों को मूव करता हूँ:-

157. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में समान नागरिक संहिता बनाने संबंधी उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

158. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश में संपूर्ण गोवंश हत्या/गोवध की रोक का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

159. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में नशीली वस्तुओं के उपयोग पर रोक लगाने का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

160. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में भ्रष्टाचार को रोकने हेतु प्रभावी कदम उठाने का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

161. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में बंगलादेश के नागरिकों की भारत में अवैध घुसपैठ तथा भारत में गैरकानूनी रह रहे/बसे नागरिकों को भारत से निकालने का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

162. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश के जनजातीय क्षेत्रों के समुचित विकास हेतु किसी विशेष योजना का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

163. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में जल संचयन हेतु प्रत्येक गांव में पोखर या जलाशय निर्माण हेतु समयबद्ध योजना का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

164. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में छोटे और सीमांत किसानों की उपज को लाभकारी बनाने हेतु प्रभावी उपायों का उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

165. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में कृषि-उत्पादन लागत में कमी लाने हेतु मूल्यों में कटौती करने के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

166. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में केन्द्रीय मंत्रिमंडल और विभिन्न राज्यों के मंत्रिमंडल में दागी व्यक्तियों की मौजूदगी के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

167. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में सार्वजनिक वितरण प्रणाली की विफलता के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

168. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश में बढ़ती गरीबी का कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

169. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में बिजली की अत्यधिक कमी तथा राष्ट्रीय विद्युत ग्रिड यथाशीघ्र बनाये जाने की आवश्यकता का कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (उत्तराचंल) : सर, मैं संशोधन संख्या 170 मूव करती हूं:-

170. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में महिलाओं के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

प्रो. रामबक्श सिंह वर्मा (उत्तर प्रदेश) : उपसभापति महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित संशोधनों को मूव करता हूं:-

171. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में आलू उत्पादक किसानों की बिगड़ती वित्तीय स्थिति को बेहतर बनाने के लिए उत्तर प्रदेश के आलू उत्पादक जिलों, विशेषकर फर्रूखाबाद, कन्नौज और मैनपुरी में, आलू आधारित कृषि उद्योगों की स्थापना के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

172. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में फसल बीमा योजना की कमियों को दूर करने और यह सुनिश्चित करने के लिए इसे अधिक प्रभावी बनाने कि प्राकृतिक आपदा के कारण फसल के नष्ट हो जाने/फसल न होने की स्थिति में प्रभावित किसान बिना किसी समस्या के बीमा कंपनियों से पैसा प्राप्त कर सकें, कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

173. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश के सभी जलकुंडों को, उनसे गाद निकाल कर, गहरा करने और इस प्रकार चैक बांधों का निर्माण करके अमूल्य पानी का संचयन करने और प्रभावी तरीके से वर्षा जल संचयन आरंभ करने का कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है ताकि भूमिगत जल स्तर को ऊपर उठाया जा सके और भूमि को बंजर होने से बचाया जा सके।"

174. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश में उपलब्ध भूमि के प्रत्येक टुकड़े पर छायादार और फलदार वृक्ष लगाने का कार्य जन आंदोलन के माध्यम से युद्ध स्तर पर जारी करने के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है ताकि प्रदूषण को कम से कम किया जा सके।"

175. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में युद्ध स्तर पर शैक्षिक संस्थाओं को सुदृढ़ बनाने, प्राइमरी स्तर से उच्चतर शैक्षिक स्तर तक अध्यापकों और गैर शिक्षण स्टाफ के रिक्त पदों को भरने के संबंध में सकल घरेलू उत्पाद का कम से कम 6 प्रतिशत व्यय करने और शैक्षिक संस्थाओं में शैक्षिक वातावरण कायम करने के सरकार के संकल्प के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

176. प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात्:-

"किन्तु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में कन्नौज और फर्रूखाबाद जिलों में कनुआ, चिपासार, श्रींगिरामपुर, सनकिटा और काम्पिल को पुरातत्व की दृष्टि से महत्वपूर्ण स्थल घोषित करने और विशेष उपायों के माध्यम से केंद्र सरकार द्वारा इनके विकास के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं किया गया है।"

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos.117 to 208) to be moved by Shri Nand Kishore Yadav. He is not present.

Dr. P.C. ALEXANDER (Maharashtra) : Sir, I beg to move the following amendments-

209. That at the end of the Motion, the following be added namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need and importance of comprehensive statutory reforms to improve the functioning of political parties in the true spirit of the Parliamentary system of Government."

210. That at the end of the Motion, the following be added namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the need for total restructuring of the educational system in the country to make it play a useful role in ensuring accelerated social and economic development, in fostering national integration and unity and in improving the working of our democratic institutions."

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos.211 to 222) to be moved by Shri Manoj Bhattacharya. He is not present. Shri N.K. Premachandran. He is also not present.

The Motion and the Amendments are moved. Therefore, now they are open for discussion.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI JASWANT SINGH): Sir, I rise to oppose the Motion that has been moved by the hon. Deputy

Leader of the House. It is quite an extraordinary circumstance in which we are discussing President's Address to the Joint Session of the Houses. I thought I would first have the benefit of hearing the intervention supporting the Motion, by Dr. Karan Singh and my good friend, Shri Vayalar Ravi. In fact, I volunteered to him that I would be very happy to hear him, if he chose to speak now. I would be quite happy to hear him and be benefited by his advice in this matter. So, I said that it was quite an extraordinary circumstance in which we were meeting. There are occasions when the events are such and of such dimension that they really require or merit no further comment because the events themselves are a comment upon our times. It is a matter, I believe, Sir, of collective concern that between the President's Address and today a series of events have taken place connected, more particularly, with the appointment and functioning of Governors of States; thereafter, how the mandate won by one party or the other party is to be interpreted and how is the Governor to convert that mandate into the legitimate right of one party or the other. A great deal of comment on this has already been made. It is not my function to go into further detailed analysis. Perhaps, other speakers will do so. For example, what has happened in the State of Goa? It was not edifying to anybody. I remember I had an occasion to submit to the hon. Prime Minister that what is now happening in the State of Goa brings no distinction upon any of us. Therefore, there is a certain course of action that we ought to adopt as a Republic, for the sake of the benefit of the health of the nation. We finally arrived at the decision of President's rule in Goa. But we arrived at this decision after a lapse of time and, I believe, that lapse of time has cost us as a country and as a political community. Just before I came here, I found my two eminent colleagues and friends with whom I have had the benefit of working earlier, hon. Shri Yashwant Sinha and Shri Arun Shourie who were sitting outside. I asked them, "What am I to speak on this debate? What is if that I ought to say?" Of course, one of the issues on which both of them told me to speak was, I ought to, at least, bring to the attention of the House the great erosion of institutional strength that we today suffer from as a republic. If the institutions on which the republic is structured, are rendered inoperative and weak, by what we do or fail to do, then I believe, Sir, we are guilty of very substantial wrong and very substantive wrong to the country. I found it very disappointing and very saddening that when the occasion arose -- I wouldn't go into the appointment of Governors; that is now a *fait accompli*; it was accompanied by a certain degree of controversy. But that is now in the past -- for example, what happened in the State of

Jharkhand or what happened in the State of Goa or what is happening in Bihar now certainly is a matter of very great concern. But what is of greater concern is when very senior members of the Government, of the Union Cabinet - it is not my function to name who said what and in which private conversation - were to suggest that they do not know what is happening; they have not known what was happening and therefore, they are not now responsible for what is to happen. This is an extremely worrisome proposition. I remember an occasion earlier when my senior colleague, the Leader of the Opposition in Lok Sabha and I had to seek the courtesy of the Prime Minister and submit to him about what a certain State of the Union had done in regard to River Water. Unilaterally, that State had chosen to enact a law in that particular State, which without doubt affects the rights of other States. The hon. Prime Minister was then accompanied by all the senior colleagues that he has. The Prime Minister informed us that he has no knowledge either of what is happening today or of what is going to happen. Sir, I believe that the Government must always know ; not only must the Government always know what is happening but it must also know what the right thing to do is; thereafter, there is yet another obligation upon the Government, on any Government. That is why this development or evolution of the present system so troubles us. Sir, to start with, the Government said, "We don't know what is happening." Thereafter, they said, "We do not know what the right thing is." And, thereafter, the right thing is not done until the events compelled the right thing to be done. That is why this unseemly scramble today on everybody's part to say, "No; we have nothing to do with it. We do not know it." This is a very sad commentary. When Members of the Government are sitting pretty -- should I say, on the scene of the crime, or, should I say, where the action is; would this be more polite why to say it-- and thereafter the Prime Minister or senior Ministers of the Government do not know what is happening and the scramble then takes place; how are we there going to comment on this position, when the Government, by its own admission, says that it did not know what was happening. That is why it is a very sad development that today the media, particularly the visual media, has converted what we do or failed to do into a kind of spectators' sport. I mean, all of us. It but that is only a small part of what concerns us today.

Sir, another sad thing is that it looks as if the abbreviation 'UPA' is itself a misnomer. We are informed that it is a 'United and a Progressive Alliance'. But from what we have witnessed in the last several weeks, it has not demonstrated any unity. And I do not know what they are

progressive about? I have seen political partners in a Government disagreeing on certain things. But I have never seen them publicly stating it. And I have not seen partners who are united and progressive and are in alliance with each other saying -- if you forgive me, I don't remember the exact words; but the meaning was clear enough -- जैसे सांप का मुंह रेत में रगड़ते हैं, रगड़ दूं मैं। आप रगड़ेंगे। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री मुरली सीताराम देवरा (महाराष्ट्र) : जनता पार्टी के समय में क्या बोल रहे थे आपको ध्यान नहीं है।...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री उपसभापति : देखिए-देखिए, ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I don't think that my good friend, the hon. 'Member from Manhattan', understands this. But the fact is that one wrong does not convert another wrong into a right. This is a very sad development. This is the reason because of which political expediency exhibits little governance; and it has robbed this government of one of the most important requirements, which I have often said earlier, which is the lesson that I learnt from my wise friend -- he was much older than me. He is no more with us; but he took great interest in me, I speak, of course, of late P.N. Haksar. And I am talking to you of early eighties. He called me and said, "आप जसवन्त सिंह हैं।" हां, मैं बोल रहा हूं। मैं आपसे आकर मिलना चाहता हूं। वे आये थे, अपने आप गाड़ी चलाकर आये थे। उसके बाद उनसे बहुत अच्छी बातचीत होती थी। कई सालों तक उनकी मेहरबानी मुझ पर रही, जब तक कि वे चल नहीं बसे। एक बार उन्होंने मुझसे कहा था कि 'जसवन्त याद रखना, हमारे मुल्क की मिल्कियत में दो चीजें बहुत जरूरी हैं। एक है सुनवाई और दूसरा है इकबाल' । मुझे ऐसा लगता है कि अभी जो पिछले चंद दिनों में घटनाएं हुई, उनकी सुनवाई बंद हो गई है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI MURLI DEORA: Sir, there is something wrong with the sound system.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It will be corrected.

श्री जसवन्त सिंह : प्रधान मंत्री जी वहां बैठे हैं। मुझे लगता है कि पिछले चंद दिनों की, कुछ हफ्तों की घटनाएं जो हुई हैं, उनकी सुनवाई भी बंद हो गई। इसमें तो कोई शक नहीं कि हम सबका इकबाल कुछ मरा, परन्तु सरकार का 'इकबाल' कहां गया, यह सरकार को खुद ख्याल करने की जरूरत है। इसके जो कांसीक्वेंसिज़ हैं, मैं बहुत ही संकोच के साथ कहता हूं, इतिहास जो पढ़ते हैं और अभी यह जरूरी हो गया है कि हम इतिहास पढ़ें, In the days of the later Mughals, what was the state of India? मुझे इसमें कोई डाउट नहीं कि आदरणीय प्रधान मंत्री जी जानते होंगे, शहनशाह-ए-आलम, अब दिल्ली-ए-पालम। शाहआलम थे, कहा जाता था कि उनके दिनों में, उनकी हुकूमत बस पालम तक सिकुड़ कर रह गई थी। वे नाम के बादशाह थे। आज दिल्ली की सरकार और जो हमारी सरकार है, आप उसमें राज़ करें।

दिल्ली की मिल्कियत, दिल्ली की सरकार में, एकरूप में हम सब की जिम्मेदारी बनती है। मैं यह मानता हूं कि दिल्ली अपने आप में एक माया नगरी है। यह किसी की नहीं हुई और किसी की होगी भी नहीं, परन्तु यह तो बहुत जरूरी है कि यहां जो कुछ हुआ, यहां के राजकाज़ का जिसका जिम्मा है, वह ऐसा तो नहीं हो जाये कि पालम तक भी आपकी मिल्कियत न हो। आज भारत में ऐसा है, यह सुनकर के बहुत ही दुख होता है कि यह क्यों हुआ? मैं काफी दिनों से देख भी रहा था और सोच भी रहा था। सर, एक तो ऐसा हुआ कि इस सरकार के आने के बाद हमारी समझ में नहीं आया, where the actual centres of power are. There are several centres of power, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*... And what is really troublesome... ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, they should not interrupt. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री जसवन्त सिंह : आप छोड़िये। आप छोड़िये। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री उपसभापति : आप इनको अपनी बात कह लेने दीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री जसवन्त सिंह : कुछ थोड़ी नोक-झोंक होना तो पार्लियामेंट का स्वभाव है। मैं जानता हूं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... यह पार्लियामेंट का स्वभाव है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री अमर सिंह (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मुरली देवरा जी अनुभवी सदस्य हैं, उनका बुरा मत मानिये। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री जसवन्त सिंह : जैसे कि आप जानते हैं कि आग का स्वभाव जलाने का होता है, तो हमारे मित्रों का स्वभाव है बैठे-बैठे टिप्पणी करने का। हमको इससे कोई दिक्कत नहीं है। हम टिप्पणी सुन भी लें। Now, one of the difficulties in the functioning of this Government, as we see and, I am sure, the thinking of the components of the Government, or, the U.P.A., also reflects on it, is that there are too many centres of power.

There are too many centres of power. I look, Sir, at the hon. the Prime Minister, when I say, amongst these centres of power, he has great competence but without authority. But, I am unable to look at hon. the Prime Minister when I say that we have authority where there is no competence. How will this combination ever function? And the price the country today pays is precisely on this account that what we have is the great competence in the hon. the Prime Minister, his lifetime experience of high administrative ability, but no authority and the reverse of it. मैं इस पर ज्यादा नहीं ठहरूंगा, अब आगे चलूं। एक दूसरा लफ्ज़, because other details, I am sure, my colleagues who speak later will touch upon.

Sir, there is a word that often comes in President's Address, and which is a very fine evocative phrase. Sir, it is a very fine evocative phrase

which speaks of an 'inclusive society, caring polity' and there is also a comment about our economy. This is a very evocative sentence; a very fine sentence. It is also a very noble aspiration. On the substance of it, I don't think, anyone can possibly disagree. Inclusiveness के बारे में मैं आपसे एक अर्ज करूं। बात फिर बहुत पुरानी हो गयी। माननीय ज्ञानी जैल सिंह जी उन दिनों होम मिनिस्टर हुआ करते थे। मुझे प्रतिपक्ष की और पार्टी की ओर से -- असम में बहुत तकलीफ थी, असम में आंदोलन चल रहा था -- बताया गया था कि तुम्हें उसमें बैठना है, बैठे। ज्ञानी जी ने बड़े ज्ञान का एक फ्रेज़ उस वक्त इस्तेमाल किया था। बाद में उन्होंने पंजाब के context में फिर इस्तेमाल किया था, inclusiveness तो वह है, डिप्टी चेयरमैन साहब जिसमें "रोणा वी सांझा ते हसना वी सांझा" This is almost an incomparable phrase, Sir. "रोणा वी सांझा ते हसना वी सांझा" And I do believe, Sir, that लफ्ज़ अपने आप में बहुत अच्छा है, "inclusiveness" अब इसका हिन्दी का कोई अनुवाद करें तो सबसे निकट हम शायद पहुंचेगे, साहचर्य के। साहचर्य के ही भाव ने, ऐसी मेरी मान्यता है जहां मैं जन्मा और बड़ा हुआ, गांवों में जाति, शिक्षा, धर्म आदि की दीवारों को लांघ करके साथ रहने के कारण एक परिवार का भाव पैदा किया। यह फिर एक संयोग की बात है, हमारे बहुत ही विद्वान सदस्य अब नहीं रहे, बहुत ही आदरणीय सदस्य जो विद्वान भी थे, विचारक भी थे, लेखक भी थे -- मैं माननीय विद्या निवास मिश्र जी की बात कर रहा हूं। उनका एक वाक्य आता है। वे गांव के परिवारों की बात कर रहे हैं। "यह परिवार का भाव फैल कर, पुरइन के पात की तरह पसरकर, पेड़-पौधों को, पशु-पक्षियों को अपने स्नेहपाश में बांध लेता था और यह बंधन व्यक्ति का, छोटी सी निजता से मोक्ष था। आज उस ओझल होते साहचर्य के भाव को बिसूर रहा हूं।" I don't think I can possibly improve upon the articulation of that sentence क्योंकि inclusiveness, साहचर्य का अर्थ केवल साथ रहना नहीं है, केवल बोलना नहीं है, साथ रहने के कारण हममें जो संस्कार उत्पन्न हो, वह भी है। मैं सोचता हूं कि पहला संस्कार प्रभुता का आभास है, प्रभु होकर के कोई inclusive नहीं रहते। If your style of functioning is imbued with प्रभुता, then you can't have it. उसमें प्रभुता रहेगी साहचर्य नहीं आएगा। महोदय, इसीलिए साहचर्य Inclusiveness पालन करने के लिए होता है, यह समझाने के लिए नहीं है। इसके बावजूद आप inclusiveness साहचर्य की बात करेंगे तो फिर माफ कीजिए यह एक ढकोसला हो जाता है। क्योंकि जो आपके हैं, वे तो आपके हैं और जो हम हैं, वे पराए हैं। यह तो फिर साहचर्य नहीं है, Inclusive नहीं हुआ, यह तो फिर हर चीज को वोट के तराजू में तोलना हुआ। इससे साहचर्य नहीं आता है, इससे तो अलगाव आता है। यह एक सही बात है कि आज की राजनीति, राजनीतिक शैली और व्यवहार में अगर पहली कीमत कहीं दी गई है तो वह साहचर्य के भाव से दी है, वह Inclusiveness से ली है तो उसी से हम सब बहुत गरीब भी हो जाते हैं। डिप्टी चेयरमैन साहब, मुझे फिर एक बात याद आती है, एक बहुत ही दुखद अवसर था। हरमन्दिर साहब तोड़ दिया गया था। अहमद शाह अब्दाली के बाद पहली बार उसने तोड़ा था और वहां पर घोड़े बांधे थे। छोड़िए, बात बीत गई है। जब यहां से जाना था, माननीय वैंकट रमन जी उस वक्त रक्षा मंत्री थे, और वे जहाज लेकर अमृतसर जा रहे थे, यह देखने के लिए कि वहां पर क्या हुआ है। उस वक्त मैंने अटल जी से कहा था कि 'आप जैसे भी करें, मुझे वैंकट रमन जी के साथ भेज दीजिए।' उन्होंने मुझ से कहा कि तुम अपने आप बात करो, वे तुम्हें जरूर ले जाएंगे। जब हमने वैंकट रमन साहब से गुजारिश की तो उन्होंने कहा कि आप आइए और चलिए। मेरे साथ एक

कांग्रेस पार्टी की सदस्या थीं, मैं यहां पर किसी का नाम नहीं लूंगा। वे हरमन्दिर साहब को देखकर टूट गईं और वे खड़ी नहीं हो सकीं। फिर उन्होंने मुझे कहा, 'जसवन्त तुम मेरे भाई हो, मेरी पार्टी को मत बताना कि मैंने ऐसा बर्ताव किया।' आज उस बात को फिर याद करने से बहुत दुख होता है। मैं आपको बतलाता हूं कि मैं किस लिए यह कहता हूं, मैं इसलिए कहता हूं क्योंकि यह मेरा विश्वास है कि आज हमारे भारत में जितने भी मंदिर, मस्ज़िद और गिरजाघर हैं, मुझे जैसा सुकून हरमन्दिर साहब में जाने से मिलता था, जब मैं 1965 में फौज में था ...**(व्यवधान)**... मैं समझा नहीं कि किस बात से शिकायत हुई है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF COMPANY AFFAIRS (SHRI PREM CHAND GUPTA): I think, this should have been considered at the time of Babri Masjid demolition or in Gujarat also when people were butchered. ...*(Interruptions)*...

PROF. P.J. KURIAN (Kerala) : This has nothing to do with President's Address. He should speak on President's Address. What he says is nothing about President's Address. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री उपसभापति : कुरियन जी, बैठिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... Please sit down, Mr. Kurian. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: There is, in Harmandir Sahib, a sense of space, openness, light. I remember, on return to Delhi, I wrote and contributed a piece, if I recollect, right to *The Indian Express*, which published it. In it I had said a great wrong has been committed by the Hindu, they must recognised what a great wrong had been committed on that particular day. That is a matter of record. उसी में मैंने शायद लिखा था, वह अपने आप में कबीर का That incomparable पद है,

अव्वल अल्लाह नूर उपाया,
कुदरत के सब बन्दे।
इक नूर से सब जग उपज्या,
कौन भले कौन मन्दे।।

नानक का है, कबीर कहते हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**... हो सकता है। मैंने कबीर की एक ग्रंथावली में इसे देखा, इसलिए कहता हूं ...**(व्यवधान)**...

विधि और न्याय मंत्री (श्री हंसराज भारद्वाज) : गुरु नानक देव जी का है।

श्री जसवन्त सिंह : हो सकता है, नानक देव जी का है, उन्हीं का है। हुआ यह था कि नानक देव जी के ऐसे कई सारे और कबीर के भी कई सारे ऐसे थे, कॉमन था, लेना-देना बहुत था। सर, आगे चलें, क्योंकि अपने आप में जो बात है -

अव्वल अल्लाह नूर उपाया,
कुदरत के सब बंदे,
इक नूर ते सब जब उपज्या,
कौन भले, कौन मंदे।

I do believe that there is a profound philosophical correctness in this. But in this correctness साहचर्य भी है, समझ भी है, लेना-देना भी है, इसीलिए कंसेन्सिस की बात कही जाती है। Sir, civility in this course is the first requirement of Consensus and that civility is an essential integral of this course between Government and the Opposition. How do we judge, Sir? How do we judge the performance of this Government? I do again refer to the removal, the abrupt removal of Governors because they subscribed to a different political philosophy. That is what we were explained by hon., the Home Minister, is the ground why they have been removed. Not only that, Sir, civil servants who had worked in the NDA Government with great diligence and application for the country are also so removed. This is also an aspect of lack civility and *sahchariya* and inconclusiveness. Some persistent calling of names -- I cite here, Sir, the example of the hon., the Minister of Human Resource Development . Unfortunately, he is not here. But, he has, of course, ever since he returned to office, deliberately and persistently refused to even acknowledge -- leave alone have the minimum of courtesy -- the presence of the BJP or of the NDA. That is his choice, Sir, whenever he chooses to intervene in the House, he does so in the style and intonation of धीमी गति के समाचार, when he does even handily, he manages to cast a pall of scrupulous melancholy and unremitting gloom over all of us and indeed the entire House. Now, of course, it is for the Government to choose whom they have as their colleagues. इसके बाद आपने बहुत कुछ 'कॉमन मैन' के बारे में कहा कि हम जो बहुत कुछ करते हैं, वह कॉमन मैन के लिए करते हैं। निश्चित तौर पर मैं सोचता हूं कि माननीय मनमोहन सिंह जी और मुरली मनोहर जोशी जी इससे परिचित होंगे कि मध्ययुगीन भारत में कभी पलटू साहब हुए थे। पलटू साहब की जो कविताएं थीं, वे अपने आप में बहुत बेजोड़ रही हैं। देखिए, एक मिनट भी नहीं लगेगा :

तंबू है आसमां, जमीं का फरस बिछाया,
छिमा किया छिड़काव, खुसी का मुस्क लगाया।
नाम खजाना भरा, जिकिर का नेजा चलता,
साहिब चौकीदार देखि इबलीसहूं डरता।
पलटू दुनिया दीन में, उनसे बड़ा न कोय,
साहिब वही फकीर है, जो कोई पहुंचा होय।

आप कॉमन मैन की बात करते हैं तो मुझे लगता कि शायद आपकी सरकार में बहुत सारे सदस्यों को कॉमन मैन की जानकारी ही नहीं है। सेक्युलरिज्म के बारे में बहुत कुछ सरकार कहती है। मुझे काफी अरसा हो गया, सदन में सेक्युलरिज्म पर नहीं बोला, आज सोचता हूं कि इस पर कुछ विचार रखूं। यह भी एक संयोग की बात है कि आज सुबह बहुत सवेरे, हमारे राजस्थान के कुछ लोग मिलने आए। फिर मुझे एक कमेन्चे की आवाज आई।

कमंचा एक म्युज़िकल इंस्ट्रूमेंट है, यह सारंगीनुमा होता है। मुझे उसकी आवाज़ आई। जैसे तीन-चार लोग मिलकर प्रभाती गाते हैं और जैसा कि आप जानते हैं, भोर से पहले गांवों में जो भजन होता है, उसको प्रभाती कहते हैं। मोटे तौर पर उसके लफ्ज़ इस तरह थे कि

जनकपुरी में जनक बिराजे, रामचन्द्र अवतरिया।
धन जनक राजा थारे घर देवता उतरिया ।।

यह वे हमारी भाषा में कह रहे थे। मैं सैक्युलरिज्म इसलिए कह रहा हूं क्योंकि आपका कृत्रिम सैक्युलरिज्म है। ये सभी जो गा रहे थे, प्रभाती गा रहे थे, वे हमारे गांव की, ननिहाल की भाषा में गा रहे थे, विरासी नहीं, विरासियों का तो धंधा है शायद ऐसे गाने का।

मैं कई बार सोचता हूं कि आजकल सत्ता, सैक्युलरवाद पर एकांतिक अधिकार जमाए हुए है। जो राजसत्ता में नहीं है, उसे सैक्युलर कहलाने के लिए लाइसेंस लेने की जरूरत पड़ती है। जिसको यह लाइसेंस सरकार से नहीं मिलता, वह गैर-सैक्युलर तो है ही, पर उसको मनुष्यता की सूची से भी खारिज किया जाता है। हां, अगर आप अपने आपको "हिंदू" कहना छोड़ दें तो यह लाइसेंस तत्काल मिल जाएगा। "हिंदू" नाम से जाने जानेवाले किसी भी विश्वास या मत के अलावा छूट है कि आप किसी गैर-हिंदू के नाम से जाने जानेवाले किसी भी मत को कितनी भी कट्टरता से मानें, वह पूरी तरह सैक्युलर है।

मैं कई बार सोचता हूं कि विजयदशमी का पर्व हमारे लिए सैक्युलर पर्व नहीं रहा, रामलीला भी सैक्युलर नहीं रही। इसी रामलीला का यदि कोई विद्रूप अभिनीत हो, तो वह सैक्युलर हो सकता है। "मेघनाद वध" सैक्युलर है, "साकेत" गैर-सैक्युलर है। "रामचरितमानस" तो खैर घोर गैर-सैक्युलर है। इसी तरह से मैं उदाहरण दे सकता हूं कि अगर उस्ताद अलाउद्दीन साहब का सरोद, शारदा की आराधना से शुरू हो, तो उसमें कोई दिक्कत नहीं है, परन्तु अगर कोई और कार्यक्रम सरस्वती वंदना से शुरू हो, तो वह गैर-सैक्युलर ही नहीं है, वह तो कुफ्र हो जाता है। अपने तखल्लुस में "पिया" शब्द जोड़ने वाले वाज़िद अली शाह की ठुमरी सैक्युलर है, लेकिन अगर ठुमरी में गाए जाने वाले वाक्य हैं -"कन्हैया" और "राधा प्यारी", तो वह गैर-सैक्युलर हो जाते हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**...

डा. प्रभा ठाकुर : यह कौन कह रहा है ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री उपसभापति : आप बैठिए ना ...**(व्यवधान)**... उनको बोलने दीजिए ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्रीमती जमना देवी बारुपाल : "जब तक न संतोष धन, सब धन धूल समान", इनके भाषण पर यही लागू होता है ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री उपसभापति : आप बैठिए।

श्री जसवन्त सिंह : डिप्टी चेयरमैन साहब, मैं पूरा सुन नहीं पाया कि माननीय सदस्या क्या कह रही थीं, लेकिन ये जो कुछ भी कह रही थीं, मैं इनसे पूरी तरह सहमत हूं।

मैं एक शब्द पर जरूर कुछ विचार रखना चाहूंगा। देखिए हमको बहुत विचारने की जरूरत है कि जो लफ्ज़ "सिलसिला" है और जो अर्थ "सिलसिले" का है, वही अंग्रेजी में "School" के साथ जुड़ता है। अब यहां "School" पढ़ाने वाली जगह नहीं है, "School of Thought" है और वही वैष्णव-शाक्तों में सम्प्रदाय हो जाता है और शास्त्रीय चिंतन में वही जैसे पाणिनि सम्प्रदाय है, रसवादी सम्प्रदाय है, अलंकारवादी सम्प्रदाय है, ये सब सम्प्रदाय हैं। घराने भी हैं। दुख इस बात का होता है कि यह सम्प्रदाय लफ्ज जहर से भर गया है। बाकी जितने भी हैं, वे अछूते हैं। संपूर्णानंद जी वैसे कांग्रेस के बहुत पुराने और वरिष्ठ नेताओं में थे। सर, जब मैंने 1967 में पहला इलेक्शन लड़ा था, तो वे राजस्थान के गवर्नर थे। उन्होंने एक बार, 50 साल पहले कहा था कि कभी-कभी किसी एक शब्द का गलत अनुवाद पूरे देश के सर्वनाश का कारण हो जाता है। मैं नहीं कह रहा हूँ, उन्होंने कहा और फिर उन्होंने कहा था कि इसका सबसे सटीक उदाहरण धर्म है। इस शब्द का अंग्रेजी में अनुवाद रिलिजन किया गया है। या उलट कर कहें तो रिलिजन का अनुवाद धर्म हो जाता है। ये उनके वाक्य हैं। इस अनुवाद ने देश के बौद्धिक मन को विच्छृंखल कर दिया है। सोचने वाली बात है कि क्यों और कैसे हम यहाँ फंस गए हैं? और वास्तव में ऐसे प्रश्न हैं, मेरे जैसे व्यक्ति को इंगित करते हैं कि आज मैं हिन्दू नहीं तो न मालूम क्या हूँ? फिर मैं कुछ नहीं हूँ मैं हिन्दू हूँ। हिन्दू घर में जन्म लिया, हिन्दू संस्कारों में पला, पर उसमें हमने धर्म का शब्द या हिन्दू के रूप में बचपन से कभी यह नहीं सोचा कि कोई इंसान-इंसान में फर्क है, या धर्म-धर्म में फर्क है। इसलिए सोचता हूँ कि कहाँ से हम रवाना हुए थे और कहाँ पहुँच गए And, it is with this that I weigh the word 'Hinduism' -- what is it fundamentally. Therefore, immediately, the minute you join fundamentally, you will become a fundamentalist. Sir, I have a very clear understanding of what I am required to do as a human being and as a citizen of this country. I do not think that 'secularism' means, 'I will do my thing you will do your thing and let us not throw stones at each other.' Secularism is far, far beyond that. It goes beyond self and sect. It, I believe, really is that 'I will do my thing and I will also do your thing as well' and so far as I can, 'I will worship my God but I will revere your god.' I will rejoice with you in your festivals. May you rejoice with me in mine. It is the positive way to look at what I am saying and there is a negative way to do it. मैं दो चीजें कहूँगा। मुझे संयोग से 3 बार चित्तौड़, मैं मेवाड़ का नहीं, मारवाड़ का हूँ, पार्टी ने कहा कि आपको महाराणा साहब के सामने चुनाव लड़ना है। मेरी कोई महाराणा साहब से अदावत नहीं। मेरे पूर्वज इन्हीं महाराणा के पूर्वज की रक्षा में, चित्तौड़ की रक्षा में, चित्तौड़ की घाटी में थे। बल्कि अभी भी वहाँ सक्रिय हैं। अचानक आज सुबह याद आया कि मेवाड़ का चिह्न है, चिह्न पर अंकित रहता है -- "जिही राखे धर्मने, तिही राखे करतार"। तो फिर हम इस धर्म को कहाँ छोड़ दें? आप कहते हैं कि इस धर्म को छोड़ दीजिए, धर्म सेकुलर नहीं है और अगर नहीं छोड़ते हैं तो इसकी जगह आप सेकुलरिज्म को अपना लीजिए, जरूर अपनाइए। मैं सेकुलरिज्म का जो अर्थ देखता हूँ।

इसलिए कहता हूँ कि चित्तौड़ का उल्लेख हुआ। आपने आज केसरिया को... The 'saffron' has become a pejorative term. Saffron, Sir, to us, is the colour of sacrifice. Men adorned the saffron turban when it was the final battle. Those that had the honour of fighting in the *Haraval,* fought in saffron. When women had to -- Chittor comes back to Rana -- save their honour had to commit the heroic act of *johar,* they all adorned saffron. हम कहाँ आ गए आज देश में कि आज उसी केसरिया को, उसी सेफ्रन का हम जिन शब्दों में इसका अनादर कर रहे हैं... I proceed, Sir, I thought I will share my thoughts on truism and secularism because it is seldom that we have...*(Interruptions)*... If the hon. Member does not agree with what I say, she is free to disagree. But, as I said, it was considered not a minute back, I would do your thing, you also please do my thing. I will go along with what you say; I might not revere what you say. But you should also go alongwith what I say. It is not necessary that to every sentence you must voice a disagreement because you wish to voice a certain degree of simulated loyalty. It is not necessary, it is neither needed. I believe it. Sir, we will have a full-fledged debate on the economy and the Budget. We will have a discussion on the Budget. We will also have a discussion on the Finance Bill. I do not wish to dwell too long on it. But if you separate, as this Government and the UPA has done, the centre of political authority from the seat of the principal political executive. Then, this separation of political authority and political executive can only be at the cost of governance. And, if the governance is enfeebled please take it from me that the economy, in the ultimate, will begin to pay a price. There are also too many centres in too many competing, contending interests. There is a conflict of ideologies. Obvious enough the conflict of ideologies is voiced. I do accept that the function of coalition is to manage different ideologies. We had attempted to do so for six years. And, it is because of this that there is separation of political authority, too many centres, a conflict of ideologies. It is because of this that the policy pronouncements far outstrip implementation of policy. I have observed this that this is a very big difficulty. There should, at least, be a certain degree of grace in the acknowledgement of what was inherited by way of the strength of the economy, the fundamentals of the economy. If you keep disputing that... It was not overnight suddenly that because of transformation the economy has mushroomed. It does not happen like that. I had never -- when I was given charge of the management of the Ministry of Finance -- hesitated to acknowledge how much my predecessors had done to contribute to what we were able to do achieve.

1.00 P.M.

Sir, I wish to dwell, next, on the question of security both national as also international. I believe, Sir, that on the question of security we have serious differences of opinion with the UPA Government. A part of it, of course, is born out of the management of the security since 1947. I do not wish to go into an analysis of the entire period since 1947.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is 1 o'clock now. Would you like to continue? ...*(Interruptions)*...He can conclude, then, we can break for lunch?

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ (Uttaranchal): Let him complete, Sir.

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU (West Bengal) : Sir, let us have lunch break. He can resume after lunch.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He can conclude and, then, we will disperse for lunch.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : सर, अभी प्रधानमंत्री जी भी बैठे हुए हैं। इन्हें अपनी स्पीच कंटीन्यू करने दें।

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, I will continue. Since the commencement of this Session and the formation of this Government, it is, perhaps, my first intervention in the House. Therefore, I seek the collective indulgence of the House. I must cite why we disagree and differ with the Government. I won't go into a deeper analysis of the division of the country in 1947. But that too awaits an examination of history. Sir, the manner in which the whole issue of the North East has been handled, not just by this Government, but, by earlier Congress Governments also; its example is there in what has happened in the North East. I first had an opportunity, Sir, to serve in the North East. I used the word 'serve' because I was then in uniform. It was in the late 50's.

And, thereafter, came a great traumatic event of 1962. That was a humiliating development. It is a matter of great sadness to me, Sir, and my friends in the Marxist Party still do not recognise, till today do not recognise, of the great wrong that was done upon India by the People's Republic of China. To them China was not and still is not an aggressor. For example, what happened in Mizoram? For 25 years a kind of insurgency in a pocket-sized State like Mizoram developed. It could easily have been settled.

What has happened in Nagaland or what is happening in Manipur, all these demonstrate to us your entire approach to the North East. I believe also, Sir, the decade of the 80's was, perhaps, the most destructive decade of Independence.

Early in the 80's, Sir, Assam went up in flames. I was very closely involved with it. I was in Assam. Even before the flames of Assam had been extinguished, then elections in Jammu and Kashmir and Punjab came. Punjab went up in flames in those periods. Why and how it happened? Need I go into it, Sir? Need I go into the issue of Late Bhindrawalle and what happened there? These are all the issues. I remember, Sir, in the Parliament, the present Finance Minister, when he was Minister of State for Internal Security in one of the previous Governments, standing up and saying that the criminal justice system in Punjab, and Jammu and Kashmir had collapsed. And, therefore, we had to bring in TADA, when MISA already existed. I do not want to go into what happened in 1975 and all that. That was the destructive decade of 80's. As if that was not enough, the great IPKF misadventure took place. My gallant colleague is here. We had been cadets together. He went on to become the Chief. He is my gallant friend, Shri Shankar Roy Chowdhury. IPKF had to return. Officers and men were then writing to me -- I am no longer in uniform -- that we were pushed and sent to Northern Sri Lanka, about which we did not even know without maps, and we had no knowledge of Tamil.

We could not read road signs. Sir, that troop was your contribution. Now what are the issues that afflict us internally? Sir, there has been, I believe, a silent invasion of illegal immigration. If you just come to the aspects of it, what was the population of the minorities in Pakistan in 1947? What is the population of the minorities in Pakistan today? Or, what was the population of Bangladesh when it came into existence or what is the population of Bangladesh today? These are figures that are known. A silent, unrecognised and a most unfortunate genocide has continued to take place, but we do not recognise it. Simultaneously what has happened is, Sir, that a silent invasion of illegal immigration has continued. Why we do not recognise it because we think it is somehow not secular to recognise it. I believe, Sir, that this is beyond the question of secular or non-secular. It is a security issue. You must recognise what it is. Years after years, years after years, the West Bengal Government did not recognise it. And, when hon. Buddhadeb became the Chief Minister, the first thing he said

was, this is a menace and a great threat to the State of West Bengal, as it has been to the State of Assam. Sir, I had an occasion also to get great courtesy from late B.K. Nehru. Like I cited Shri P.N. Haksar, Shri B.K. Nehru also took a great deal of interest in it. Again, I don't go by it but I received great affections from him. I asked him once why is it, Sir, you are the Governor of Jammu and Kashmir-- he is now no more -- that in a State like Jammu and Kashmir we are witnessing today this situation because he had been the Governor there, and he said, Jaswant, because the nature of Islam in Jammu and Kashmir altered but we did not recognise that it was altering. It had an Islam which was inclusive, your word, Sir, which was tolerant but instead of it an extreme variety and what we witness today is on that account. Sir, this again is a consequence. Sir, as a consequence of the proliferation of *madrasas*, I remember once mentioning to the hon. the Prime Minister some years back that it is a matter of great concern to me as a student of security issue that the Government of Pakistan has decreed that the army in Pakistan is an Islamic army. The hon. Prime Minister, then not the Prime Minister, said, you are being a communalist to call it Islamic. I was astounded. The Pakistan calls itself an Islamic Republic. What they did was to again completely transform the nature of the Army and today's Pakistan Army is not what it was in 1947 or till the time of Field Marshal Ayub or even up to 60s. Then, there is , Sir, terrorism in the approach and attitude of this Government and they started with amendment to laws. I could think, Sir, that those who had nothing to do with, TADA, MISA should now preach us lessons about their misapplications. There might have been misapplications, but because of misapplication, you refused to have an instrument of State policy which would subserve the interests of a State. He remained uncandid. What is it that we face when we talk of terrorism? So today what we have is because India is the first one to have suffered consequences, the first country to have suffered the consequences of cross-border terrorism, promoted against us, directed against us, targeting India deliberately because it was in the manner of a declared intent of policy. India to be belittled and to be brought to its knees by a policy of thousand cuts. It is announced policy. I am not coining this phrase. And, in that, Sir, what we witnessed today in terrorism is a low-cost option that has been employed against India and in this low-cost option, it tantamounts to almost a fourth generation of warfare. This is a most modern transformation of war. Terrorism, of course, undermines the national sovereignty because the terrorists and the terrorism refuses to recognise the State's monopoly over violence, and,

therefore, we have a situation in India wherein, even though the state of tension exists between India and our neighbours, simultaneously through a kind of the revolving door of events of history, terrorism enters from the other door. The terrorism today that we witness and continue to witness in India -- today we have arrested a few or what is happening in Jammu & Kashmir -- I will come in a moment to Maoists -- has gone beyond simple criminality; it has also gone beyond merely materialising as a new phenomenon in relations between countries. Sir, it has now begun to abide as an instrument of State Policy, particularly, in South Asia. Therefore, it is a matter of great worry to us. It is, of course, as I said earlier, the 'fourth generation warfare'. It is because there is a transformation of how war itself has been altered. Terrorism, of ccurse, by its very name, is highly irregular, unconventional and decentralised. It utilises the asymmetrical operations to bypass the static superiority of the nation-State. It does, and as we have witnessed, not only attack a variety of national targets, but more than that, it attacks the will of Governments and people; and in doing so, it exploits deception, denial and stealth. That is what we are witnessing here. It is because we were the first where the experiment of cross-border terrorism was experimented. I must share that one of the most important characteristics of terrorism is that it undermines the traditional State -- we are a traditional State -- at minimal cost, and it remains impervious to the best of the conventional military instruments.

That is why, Sir, I appeal to the Government that when you address these issues, please recognise that in your approach to it or with your approach to it, we have serious differences. We have had debates on this issue. I will not limit the debate merely to come to a one particular provision or another but examples like Manipur and Maoists exemplified to us what is happening.

Sir, a word about the Maoists. I find it almost unbelievable, but yet again the Union Government should say where the States are free to deal with the issue as they wish, we will not interfere. The Union Government is responsible for the security of the country. The former Chief Minister of Andhra had nearly lost his life in two Maoists attacks. How is it possible, Sir, for us to accept that Maoists can sit across the table, thus, receiving a kind of dignity of acceptance, with arms? If they do so, we have a situation now; and we keep cautioning on a kind of threat of Maoists activity, a veil of Maoists activity from the point onwards ...

Sir, let us reflect for a moment on Manipur. It is very difficult to establish peace in Manipur. Sir, I have the honour and distinction of opening the land route between Manipur and Napa, India and Myanmar, the Kalewa-Tamu route. It was the first time that that road was travelled upon, or, the first time that anybody, any official, entered Myanmar, across, by that road. Sir, what do we have in Manipur? We have a blurring of the distinction between the gun-carrying militants and the over-ground sympathisers who feed them vital information. I speak from personal experience. I have seen a number of governments of Manipur, and politicians and bureaucrats, and also the State Police; they are not free from such allegations. No one is sure as to who in the administration in Manipur has links with which terrorist group. It is not possible for me to accept that Manipur be left to stew in its own juices. I do believe, Sir, that that State Government failed long back. But the Union Government believes that by handing over the fort they are restoring to the people of Manipur a sense of pride. Maybe, Sir, that is your view. But I have difficulty accepting it, because what you are doing is to give in to the demand that really need not have been given in to. I believe that there is a lack of political will. I am sorry to have to say, but is it, Sir, because we do not wish to dismiss a Government? That State cries for Central intervention and rule by President. But you don't wish to do it because it is ruled by Congress Government. It is a very important State. In the North-East, it is one of the most troubled States today.

Sir, internationally speaking, I have a few things to share with the Government. The strategic backdrop in which we are formulating the policy options and conducting ourselves, is, I believe, extremely troubled. The region is troubled; it is not just a question of the neighbourhood. When I see the region is troubled, I see trouble not just in our immediate West but also in the East. I do believe Sir, that fundamentally, our neighbour in the west has trouble. Of course, post-election the situation in Afghanistan is better than what it was pre-election, but it is not yet out of its troubles. I cannot accept a situation in which the United States of America now addresses the issue of Iran or the manner in which it addresses it. I have grave apprehensions about the future of Iraq. In any case, it is a country that came into existence in the 1920s. Where are we headed? Where are we headed in this region? The fundamentals of the region in its totality are unstable.

Sir, within a very short time, I wish to spell here something on the nuclear question, because this was not addressed in the President's

Address, and then, I will conclude what I have to say. Sir, the international nuclear order is in a state of flux. Please, recognize that it would be a grave error on our part to work on the basis that the debate on the question of proliferation is over. It is not over. It has taken a different shape. We must understand the transformation that is taking place. The debate has gone beyond the inequities and the inequalities of the Non-Proliferation Treaty or the Test Ban Treaty and the FMCT is also currently stalemated. So far what we have witnessed, Sir, in the phenomenon of Mr. A. Q. Khan is an extremely dangerous development.

And, what is much more dangerous, to my mind, is the manner in which the western world has selectively applied itself to this question. And, the selectivity in the application of the western world even in the examples of its social advocacy of democracy is to differentiate between, for example, Pakistan and Nepal. Nepal must have democracy, but Pakistan can continue to have what it currently has as a region, and can continue to have proliferated nuclear weapons, in dealing with nuclear weapons. We need not follow the western example because it is not possible for me to do full examination of the complexities of the nuclear question. But, certainly, there are number of things, on which we have to address ourselves. There is, for example, the U.N. Security Council Resolution 1540. That 1540 is the initiative of the United States of America and it requires, it makes it mandatory on all the 191 countries of the United Nations to abide by 1540. Whether we have been able to discuss it as equals and point out the inequalities of 1540 or not, is a different question. But, there is now a Resolution and in similar terms, the new proliferation security initiative which is strengthening the legal framework of proliferation, there is also the meeting of the Nuclear Supplier Group (NSG) in Goteborg, Sweden, has that all the Member States will have a catch-all situation and that catch-all situation is irrespective of whether an item falls under dual use or does not fall under dual use, they could, when they so decide, chose not to deal with it. There are other things in the protocol of the IAEA. I have, naturally, not gone into great detail of it, but the mechanism, that the United States of America and others seem to have now acquired which is the alternative route to controlling nuclear proliferation, and that alternative route is by control over the production of fissile material, is extremely troublesome. It is a mechanism that we should address very purposefully because, if I might put it in somewhat inelegant sense, "What is goose for the gander can well become a goose for a beast also", simply to state. I conclude, Sir, by once again sharing my concern for the state of the Republic and I spoke of

institutions when I started and the organs of Republic and the guardians of the Republic, which, in a sense, we all are, but you are the senior guardian today because you are the Government of today. I don't have to prove. हमारी दिक्कत क्या है ? आप अपने व्यवहार से, आप पश्चिमी विचार के हैं, व्यवहार के हैं, आप ऐसे व्यक्तियों के नेतृत्व में केवल चलते ही नहीं हैं, आपकी पूजा व श्रद्धा भी है, हमारी नहीं हो सकती। इसीलिए आप हमें किस्म-किस्म की संज्ञाएं देते हैं, देते रहिये। अंग्रेजियत आपका इष्ट है, मेरा नहीं है। मैं भारतीय हूं, भारत का हूं, भारतीयता का पुजारी हूं। यही मेरा इष्ट है, यही मेरी पूजा है। एक और ...**(व्यवधान)**...

आप सुन लीजिए, गुरू ग्रंथ साहिब का एक शबद है, उस शबद को सुन लीजिए।

काल तुही काली तुही,
तुही तेग अरतीर।
तुही निसानी जीत की,
आज तुही जग वीर।

धन्यवाद, उप सभापति महोदय।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned for lunch for one hour.

The House then adjourned for lunch at twenty-five minutes past one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at twenty-six minutes past two of the clock,

[MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.]

SUPPLEMENTARY DEMANDS FOR GRANTS (RAILWAYS) 2004-05

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (SHRI R. VELU): Sir, I beg to lay on the Table a statement (in English and Hindi) showing the Supplementary Demands for Grants (Railways), for the year 2004-05.

SHRI R. SHUNMUGASUNDARAM (TAMIL NADU): Sir, the Opposition Party leaders in the Tamil Nadu Assembly were arrested. All the MLAs of the Opposition Party... ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is a State Subject. ...*(Interruptions)*...